

Jonathan Evans (Cal. Bar #247376)  
CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY  
1212 Broadway  
Suite 800  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Phone: 510-844-7100 x318  
Fax: 510-844-7150  
email: [jevans@biologicaldiversity.org](mailto:jevans@biologicaldiversity.org)

Counsel for Plaintiffs Center for Biological Diversity,  
Center for Environmental Health, and Clean Air Council

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY,  
CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH,  
and CLEAN AIR COUNCIL,

Plaintiffs,

v.

GINA McCARTHY,  
in her official capacity as Administrator of the  
United States Environmental Protection Agency,

Defendant.

Case No.

**COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY  
AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF**

(Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7401 *et. seq.*)

**I. INTRODUCTION**

1. Plaintiffs the Center for Biological Diversity, the Center for Environmental Health, and the Clean Air Council bring this Clean Air Act citizen suit to compel the United States Environmental Protection Agency to undertake overdue mandatory duties. Specifically,

Defendant, Gina McCarthy, in her official capacity as Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”), has failed to make findings of failure to submit under 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B), and publish notice of those findings in the Federal Register, for nonattainment state implementation plans (“SIPs”) for the 2008 ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards for the following areas and elements listed in Table 1:

**TABLE 1**

<b>AREA &amp; ELEMENT(S)</b>	<b>SUBMITTAL DEADLINE (No later than)</b>
Los Angeles-South Coast Air Basin, CA: Clean Fuels for Boilers, Contingency measures for Volatile Organic Compounds (VOC) and Nitrogen Oxides (NO <sub>x</sub> ), Contingency Provisions for Reasonable Further Progress (RFP) Milestones 182(c)(9), Enhanced Monitoring Photochemical Assessment Monitoring Stations (PAMS), Extreme Nonattainment New Source Review (NNSR), Vehicle Miles Traveled-Transportation Control Measures (VMT-TCMs) to Offset Growth	7/20/2015
San Joaquin Valley, CA: Clean Fuels for Boilers, Contingency measures for VOC and NO <sub>x</sub> , Contingency Provisions for RFP Milestones 182(c)(9), Enhanced Monitoring (PAMS), Extreme NNSR, NO <sub>x</sub> Reasonably Available Control Technology (RACT) for Major Sources, VMT-TCMs to Offset Growth	7/20/2015
Los Angeles-San Bernardino Counties (Antelope Valley), CA: Contingency measures for VOC and NO <sub>x</sub> , Contingency Provisions for RFP Milestones 182(c)(9), Enhanced Monitoring (PAMS), Severe 15 NNSR, VMT-TCMs to Offset Growth	7/20/2015
Los Angeles-San Bernardino Counties (Mojave Desert), CA: Contingency measures for VOC and NO <sub>x</sub> , Contingency Provisions for RFP Milestones 182(c)(9), Enhanced Monitoring (PAMS), Severe 15 NNSR, VMT-TCMs to	7/20/2015

1	Offset Growth	
2	Riverside County (Coachella Valley), CA:	7/20/2015
3	Contingency measures for VOC and NOx,	
4	Contingency Provisions for RFP Milestones	
	182(c)(9), Enhanced Monitoring (PAMS),	
	Severe 15 NNSR, VMT-TCMs to Offset Growth	
5	Sacramento Metro, CA: Contingency measures	7/20/2015
6	for VOC and NOx, Contingency Provisions for	
7	RFP Milestones 182(c)(9), VMT-TCMs to	
8	Offset Growth, Enhanced Monitoring (PAMS),	
9	Severe 15 NNSR for Yolo-Solano, Non-Control	
10	Techniques Guidelines VOC RACT for Major	
11	Sources for El Dorado, Sacramento, and Yolo-	
12	Solano, NOx RACT for Major Sources for El	
13	Dorado, Sacramento, and Yolo-Solano, Auto and	
14	Light-Duty Truck Assembly Coatings CTG	
15	RACT for El Dorado and Yolo-Solano,	
16	Fiberglass Boat Manufacturing Materials CTG	
17	RACT for El Dorado and Yolo-Solano, 2006	
18	Flat Wood Paneling Coatings CTG RACT for El	
19	Dorado and Yolo-Solano, Flexible Packaging	
20	Printing Material CTG RACT for El Dorado and	
21	Yolo-Solano, Industrial Cleaning Solvents	
22	(2006) CTG RACT for El Dorado and Yolo-	
23	Solano, Large Appliance Coatings (2007) CTG	
	RACT for El Dorado and Yolo-Solano,	
	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT for El	
	Dorado and Yolo-Solano, Metal Furniture	
	Coatings (2007) CTG RACT for El Dorado and	
	Yolo-Solano, Miscellaneous Industrial	
	Adhesives (2006) CTG RACT for El Dorado,	
	Sacramento and Yolo-Solano, Miscellaneous	
	Metal Products Coatings (2008) CTG RACT for	
	El Dorado and Yolo-Solano, Paper, Film, and	
	Foil Coatings (2007) CTG RACT for El Dorado	
	and Yolo-Solano, Plastic Parts Coatings (2008)	
	CTG RACT for El Dorado, Placer and Yolo-	
	Solano	
21	Ventura County, CA: Contingency measures for	7/20/2015
22	VOC and NOx, Serious NNSR	
22	Baltimore, MD: Inspection and Maintenance	7/20/2015
	(I/M) Basic	
23	Connecticut: Ozone Transport Region (OTR)	7/20/2015

1	New Source Review (NSR)	
2	Delaware: OTR NSR,	7/20/2015
3	District of Columbia: OTR NSR, Non-CTG	7/20/2015
4	VOC RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for	
5	Major Sources, Refinery Vacuum Producing	
6	Systems, Wastewater Separators and Process	
7	Unit Turnarounds CTG RACT	
8	Maine: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC RACT for	7/20/2015
9	Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major Sources,	
10	Industrial Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT	
11	Maryland: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC RACT	7/20/2015
12	for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major	
13	Sources, Fiberglass Boat Manufacturing	
14	Materials CTG RACT	
15	Massachusetts: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC	7/20/2015
16	RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major	
17	Sources, Auto and Light-Duty Truck Assembly	
18	Coatings CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat	
19	Manufacturing Materials CTG RACT, Flexible	
20	Packaging Printing Material CTG RACT,	
21	Industrial Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT,	
22	Large Appliance Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,	
23	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT, Metal	
	Furniture Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,	
	Miscellaneous Industrial Adhesives (2006) CTG	
	RACT, Miscellaneous Metal Products Coatings	
	(2008) CTG RACT, Paper, Film, and Foil	
	Coatings (2007) CTG RACT, Plastic Parts	
	Coatings (2008) CTG RACT	
	New Hampshire: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC	7/20/2015
	RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major	
	Sources	
	New Jersey: Fiberglass Boat Manufacturing	7/20/2015
	Materials CTG RACT, Industrial Cleaning	
	Solvents (2006) CTG RACT, Miscellaneous	
	Metal Products Coatings (2008) CTG RACT,	
	Paper, Film, and Foil Coatings (2007) CTG	
	RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings (2008) CTG	
	RACT	
	Pennsylvania: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC	7/20/2015
	RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major	
	Sources, Auto and Light-Duty Truck Assembly	
	Coatings CTG RACT, Flexible Packaging	
	Printing Material CTG RACT, Industrial	

1	Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT,	
2	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
3	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT,	
4	Miscellaneous Metal Products Coatings (2008)	
5	CTG RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings (2008) CTG	
6	RACT	
7	Rhode Island: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC	7/20/2015
8	RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major	
9	Sources, Auto and Light-Duty Truck Assembly	
10	Coatings CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat	
11	Manufacturing Materials CTG RACT, 2006 Flat	
12	Wood Paneling Coatings CTG RACT, Flexible	
13	Packaging Printing Material CTG RACT, Large	
14	Appliance Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,	
15	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
16	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT, Metal	
17	Furniture Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,	
18	Miscellaneous Metal Products Coatings (2008)	
19	CTG RACT, Paper, Film, and Foil Coatings	
20	(2007) CTG RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings	
21	(2008) CTG RACT	
22	Vermont: I/M Enhanced, OTR NSR, Non-CTG	7/20/2015
23	VOC RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for	
24	Major Sources, Auto and Light-Duty Truck	
25	Assembly Coatings CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat	
26	Manufacturing Materials CTG RACT, 2006 Flat	
27	Wood Paneling Coatings CTG RACT, Industrial	
28	Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT,	
29	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
30	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT,	
31	Miscellaneous Industrial Adhesives (2006) CTG	
32	RACT, Miscellaneous Metal Products Coatings	
33	(2008) CTG RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings	
34	(2008) CTG RACT	
35	Virginia: OTR NSR, Non-CTG VOC RACT for	7/20/2015
36	Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major Sources,	
37	Auto and Light-Duty Truck Assembly Coatings	
38	CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat Manufacturing	
39	Materials CTG RACT, 2006 Flat Wood Paneling	
40	Coatings CTG RACT, Flexible Packaging	
41	Printing Material CTG RACT, Industrial	
42	Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT, Large	
43	Appliance Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,	
44	Lithographic Printing Materials and Letterpress	
45	Printing Materials (2006) CTG RACT, Metal	

1	Furniture Coatings (2007) CTG RACT, Miscellaneous Industrial Adhesives (2006) CTG RACT, Miscellaneous Metal Products Coatings (2008) CTG RACT, Paper, Film, and Foil Coatings (2007) CTG RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings (2008) CTG RACT	
4	Calaveras County, CA: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
5	Kern County (Eastern Kern), CA: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
6	Mariposa County, CA: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
7	Nevada County (Western part), CA: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
8	Washington, VA: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
9	Chicago-Naperville, IL, : Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
	Cincinnati, IN: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
	Cincinnati, KY: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015
	Washington, MD: Marginal NNSR	7/20/2015

Furthermore, EPA has failed to take final action, pursuant to 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(2) – (4), to approve or disapprove, in whole or part, the 2009 ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards (“NAAQS”) nonattainment SIP submissions listed in Table 2 below:

**TABLE 2<sup>1</sup>**

AREA & STATE	ELEMENT(S)	COMPLETION DATE	FINAL ACTION DUE DATE
Philadelphia, Wilmington, Atlantic City, DE	Marginal NNSR	4/17/2014	4/17/2015
Seaford, DE	Marginal NNSR	4/17/2014	4/17/2015
Los Angeles-South Coast Air Basin, CA	Non-CTG VOC RACT for Major Sources, NOx RACT for Major Sources, Aerospace CTG RACT, Auto and Light-Duty Truck Assembly Coatings Control Technique Guidelines (CTG) Reasonably Available Control Technology, Equipment leaks from Natural	1/18/2015	1/18/2016

<sup>1</sup> Note: Submittals prior to May 21, 2012 must have been submitted for purposes of compliance with the 1997 ozone NAAQS.

1		Gas/Gasoline Processing Plants		
2		CTG RACT, Factory Surface		
3		Coating of Flat Wood Paneling		
4		CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat		
5		Manufacturing Materials CTG		
6		RACT, 2006 Flat Wood		
7		Paneling Coatings CTG RACT,		
8		Flexible Packaging Printing		
9		Material CTG RACT,		
10		Industrial Cleaning Solvents		
11		(2006) CTG RACT, Large		
12		Appliance Coatings (2007)		
13		CTG RACT, Lithographic		
14		Printing Materials and		
15		Letterpress Printing Materials		
16		(2006) CTG RACT, Metal		
17		Furniture Coatings (2007) CTG		
18		RACT, Miscellaneous		
19		Industrial Adhesives (2006)		
20		CTG RACT, Miscellaneous		
21		Metal Products Coatings (2008)		
22		CTG RACT, Paper, Film, and		
23		Foil Coatings (2007) CTG		
		RACT, Plastic Parts Coatings		
		(2008) CTG RACT,		
14	Sacramento Metro [Placer County], CA	Non-CTG VOC RACT for	10/30/2014	10/30/2015
15		Major Sources, Aerospace		
16		CTG RACT, Auto and Light-		
17		Duty Truck Assembly Coatings		
18		CTG RACT, Bulk Gasoline		
19		Plants CTG RACT, Equipment		
20		leaks from Natural		
21		Gas/Gasoline Processing Plants		
22		CTG RACT, Fiberglass Boat		
23		Manufacturing Materials CTG		
		RACT, Flexible Packaging		
		Printing Material CTG RACT,		
		Fugitive Emissions from		
		Synthetic Organic Chemical		
		Polymer and Resin		
		Manufacturing Equipment		
		CTG RACT, Graphic Arts –		
		Rotogravure and Flexography		
		CTG RACT, Large Appliance		
		Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,		

1		Large Petroleum Dry Cleaners		
2		CTG RACT, Leaks from		
3		Gasoline Tank Trucks and		
4		Vapor Collection Systems CTG		
5		RACT, Leaks from Petroleum		
6		Refinery Equipment CTG		
7		RACT, Manufacture of High-		
8		Density Polyethylene,		
9		Polypropylene and Polystyrene		
10		Resins CTG RACT,		
11		Manufacture of Pneumatic		
12		Rubber Tires CTG RACT,		
13		Manufacture of Synthesized		
14		Pharmaceutical Products CTG		
15		RACT, Metal Furniture		
16		Coatings (2007) CTG RACT,		
17		Miscellaneous Industrial		
18		Adhesives (2006) CTG RACT,		
19		Miscellaneous Metal Products		
20		Coatings (2008) CTG RACT,		
21		Paper, Film, and Foil Coatings		
22		(2007) CTG RACT, Petroleum		
23		Liquid Storage in External		
		Floating Roof Tanks CTG		
		RACT, Refinery Vacuum		
		Producing Systems,		
		Wastewater Separators and		
		Process Unit Turnarounds CTG		
		RACT, Synthetic Organic		
		Chemical Manufacturing		
		Industry (SOCMI) Air		
		Oxidation Processes CTG		
		RACT, SOCMI Distillation and		
		Reactor Processes CTG RACT,		
		Shipbuilding/repair CTG		
		RACT, Solvent Metal Cleaning		
		CTG RACT, Storage of		
		Petroleum Liquids in Fixed		
		Roof Tanks CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating for Insulation		
		of Magnet Wire CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating of		
		Automobiles and Light-Duty		
		Trucks CTG RACT, Surface		
		Coating of Cans CTG RACT,		



1		Surface Coating of Coils CTG RACT, Surface Coating of		
2		Fabrics CTG RACT, Surface		
3		Coating of Large Appliances		
4		CTG RACT, Surface Coating		
5		of Metal Furniture CTG RACT,		
6		Surface Coating of		
7		Miscellaneous Metal Parts and		
8		Products CTG RACT, Surface		
9		coating of Paper CTG RACT,		
10		Tank Truck Gasoline Loading		
11		Terminals CTG RACT, Use of		
12		Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT,		
13		Wood Furniture CTG RACT,		
14	San Joaquin Valley, CA	Non-CTG VOC RACT for	1/18/2015	1/18/2016
15		Major Sources, Aerospace		
16		CTG RACT, Auto and Light-		
17		Duty Truck Assembly Coatings		
18		CTG RACT, Bulk Gasoline		
19		CTG RACT, Equipment leaks		
20		from Natural Gas/Gasoline		
21		Processing Plants CTG RACT,		
22	Connecticut	Non-CTG VOC RACT for	1/18/2015	1/18/2016
23		Major Sources, NOx RACT for		
24		Major Sources, Aerospace		
25		CTG RACT, Auto and Light-		
26		Duty Truck Assembly Coatings		
27		CTG RACT, Bulk Gasoline		
28		CTG RACT, Equipment leaks		
29		from Natural Gas/Gasoline		
30		Processing Plants CTG RACT,		
31	Sacramento-Yolo- Solano, CA	Aerospace CTG RACT,	7/31/2007	7/31/2008
32		Equipment leaks from Natural		
33		Gas/Gasoline Processing Plants		
34		CTG RACT, Factory Surface		
35		Coating of Flat Wood Paneling		
36		CTG RACT, Fugitive		
37		Emissions from Synthetic		
38		Organic Chemical Polymer and		
39		Resin Manufacturing		
40		Equipment CTG RACT,		
41		Graphic Arts – Rotogravure		
42		and Flexography CTG RACT,		
43		Large Petroleum Dry Cleaners		
44		CTG RACT, Leaks from		

1		Gasoline Tank Trucks and		
2		Vapor Collection Systems CTG		
3		RACT, Leaks from Petroleum		
4		Refinery Equipment CTG		
5		RACT, Manufacture of High-		
6		Density Polyethylene,		
7		Polypropylene and Polystyrene		
8		Resins CTG RACT,		
9		Manufacture of Pneumatic		
10		Rubber Tires CTG RACT,		
11		Manufacture of Synthesized		
12		Pharmaceutical Products CTG		
13		RACT, Petroleum Liquid		
14		Storage in External Floating		
15		Roof Tanks CTG RACT,		
16		Refinery Vacuum Producing		
17		Systems, Wastewater		
18		Separators and Process Unit		
19		Turnarounds CTG RACT,		
20		SOCMI Air Oxidation		
21		Processes CTG RACT, SOCMI		
22		Distillation and Reactor		
23		Processes CTG RACT,		
		Shipbuilding/repair CTG		
		RACT, Solvent Metal Cleaning		
		CTG RACT, Storage of		
		Petroleum Liquids in Fixed		
		Roof Tanks CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating for Insulation		
		of Magnet Wire CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating of		
		Automobiles and Light-Duty		
		Trucks CTG RACT, Surface		
		Coating of Cans CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating of Coils CTG		
		RACT, Surface Coating of		
		Fabrics CTG RACT, Surface		
		Coating of Large Appliances		
		CTG RACT, Surface Coating		
		of Metal Furniture CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating of		
		Miscellaneous Metal Parts and		
		Products CTG RACT, Surface		
		coating of Paper CTG RACT,		
		Tank Truck Gasoline Loading		

1		Terminals CTG RACT, Use of		
2		Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT,		
3	Pennsylvania	Wood Furniture CTG RACT,	3/28/2007	3/28/2008
4		Aerospace CTG RACT, Bulk		
5		Gasoline CTG RACT,		
6		Equipment leaks from Natural		
7		Gas/Gasoline Processing Plants		
8		CTG RACT, Fugitive		
9		Emissions from Synthetic		
10		Organic Chemical Polymer and		
11		Resin Manufacturing		
12		Equipment CTG RACT,		
13		Graphic Arts – Rotogravure		
14		and Flexography CTG RACT,		
15		Large Petroleum Dry Cleaners		
16		CTG RACT, Leaks from		
17		Gasoline Tank Trucks and		
18		Vapor Collection Systems CTG		
19		RACT, Leaks from Petroleum		
20		Refinery Equipment CTG		
21		RACT, Manufacture of High-		
22		Density Polyethylene,		
23		Polypropylene and Polystyrene		
		Resins CTG RACT,		
		Manufacture of Pneumatic		
		Rubber Tires CTG RACT,		
		Manufacture of Synthesized		
		Pharmaceutical Products CTG		
		RACT, Petroleum Liquid		
		Storage in External Floating		
		Roof Tanks CTG RACT,		
		Refinery Vacuum Producing		
		Systems, Wastewater		
		Separators and Process Unit		
		Turnarounds CTG RACT,		
		SOCMI Air Oxidation		
		Processes CTG RACT, SOCMI		
		Distillation and Reactor		
		Processes CTG RACT,		
		Shipbuilding/repair CTG		
		RACT, Solvent Metal Cleaning		
		CTG RACT, Storage of		
		Petroleum Liquids in Fixed		
		Roof Tanks CTG RACT,		
		Surface Coating for Insulation		

1		of Magnet Wire CTG RACT, Surface Coating of		
2		Automobiles and Light-Duty Trucks CTG RACT, Surface		
3		Coating of Cans CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Coils CTG		
4		RACT, Surface Coating of Fabrics CTG RACT, Surface		
5		Coating of Large Appliances CTG RACT, Surface Coating		
6		of Metal Furniture CTG RACT, Surface Coating of		
7		Miscellaneous Metal Parts and Products CTG RACT, Surface		
8		coating of Paper CTG RACT, Tank Truck Gasoline Loading		
9		Terminals CTG RACT, Use of Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT,		
10		Wood Furniture CTG RACT,		
11	Sacramento, CA	Bulk Gasoline CTG RACT, Equipment leaks from Natural	1/11/2008	1/11/2009
12		Gas/Gasoline Processing Plants CTG RACT, Fugitive		
13		Emissions from Synthetic Organic Chemical Polymer and		
14		Resin Manufacturing Equipment CTG RACT, Leaks		
15		from Gasoline Tank Trucks and Vapor Collection Systems CTG		
16		RACT, Leaks from Petroleum Refinery Equipment CTG		
17		RACT, Manufacture of Synthesized Pharmaceutical		
18		Products CTG RACT, Petroleum Liquid Storage in		
19		External Floating Roof Tanks CTG RACT, SOCOMI Air		
20		Oxidation Processes CTG RACT, SOCOMI Distillation and		
21		Reactor Processes CTG RACT, Storage of Petroleum Liquids		
22		in Fixed Roof Tanks CTG RACT, Surface Coating of		
23		Automobiles and Light-Duty Trucks CTG RACT, Surface		

1		Coating of Coils CTG RACT, Tank Truck Gasoline Loading Terminals CTG RACT, Use of Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT,		
2				
3	Sacramento, CA	Factory Surface Coating of Flat Wood Paneling CTG RACT, 2006 Flat Wood Paneling Coatings CTG RACT, Flexible Packaging Printing Material CTG RACT, Graphic Arts – Rotogravure and Flexography CTG RACT, Large Appliance Coatings (2007) CTG RACT, Large Petroleum Dry Cleaners CTG RACT, Manufacture of High-Density Polyethylene, Polypropylene and Polystyrene Resins CTG RACT, Manufacture of Pneumatic Rubber Tires CTG RACT, Paper, Film, and Foil Coatings (2007) CTG RACT, Refinery Vacuum Producing Systems, Wastewater Separators and Process Unit Turnarounds CTG RACT, Shipbuilding/repair CTG RACT, Surface Coating for Insulation of Magnet Wire CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Cans CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Fabrics CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Large Appliances CTG RACT,	7/21/2009	7/21/2010
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18	E. and W. Massachusetts	2006 Flat Wood Paneling Coatings CTG RACT	7/31/2008	7/31/2009
19	Los Angeles and San Bernardino Counties (Western Mojave Desert) [Antelope Valley], CA	Graphic Arts – Rotogravure and Flexography CTG RACT, Large Petroleum Dry Cleaners CTG RACT, Leaks from Gasoline Tank Trucks and Vapor Collection Systems CTG RACT, Solvent Metal Cleaning CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Automobiles and Light-Duty Trucks CTG RACT, Surface	7/31/2007	7/31/2008
20				
21				
22				
23				

1		Coating of Cans CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Coils CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Fabrics CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Metal Furniture CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Miscellaneous Metal Parts and Products CTG RACT, Surface coating of Paper CTG RACT, Use of Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT,		
2				
3				
4				
5				
6				
7	Los Angeles and San Bernardino Counties (Western Mojave Desert) [Mojave Desert], CA	Graphic Arts – Rotogravure and Flexography CTG RACT, Leaks from Gasoline Tank Trucks and Vapor Collection Systems CTG RACT, Petroleum Liquid Storage in External Floating Roof Tanks CTG RACT, Shipbuilding/repair CTG RACT, Solvent Metal Cleaning CTG RACT, Storage of Petroleum Liquids in Fixed Roof Tanks CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Metal Furniture CTG RACT, Surface Coating of Miscellaneous Metal Parts and Products CTG RACT, Surface coating of Paper CTG RACT, Tank Truck Gasoline Loading Terminals CTG RACT, Use of Cutback Asphalt CTG RACT, Wood Furniture CTG RACT,	1/11/2008	1/11/2009
8				
9				
10				
11				
12				
13				
14				
15				
16				
17				
18	New York	Industrial Cleaning Solvents (2006) CTG RACT,	8/21/2013	8/21/2014
19				

20

21 Accordingly, Plaintiffs THE CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY, THE CENTER FOR

22 ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH, and THE CLEAN AIR COUNCIL bring this action against

23

1 Defendant GINA McCARTHY, in her official capacity as EPA Administrator, to compel her to  
2 perform these mandatory duties.

## 3 **II. JURISDICTION**

4 2. This case is a Clean Air Act citizen suit. Therefore, the Court has jurisdiction over this  
5 action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1331 (federal question jurisdiction) and 42 U.S.C. § 7604(a)(2)  
6 (citizen suits for failure to perform a non-discretionary duty required by the Clean Air Act).

7 3. An actual controversy exists between the parties. This case does not concern federal  
8 taxes, is not a proceeding under 11 U.S.C. §§ 505 or 1146, and does not involve the Tariff Act of  
9 1930. Thus, this Court has authority to order the declaratory relief requested under 28 U.S.C. §  
10 2201. If the Court orders declaratory relief, 28 U.S.C. § 2202 authorizes this Court to issue  
11 injunctive relief.

## 12 **III. NOTICE**

13 4. On May 12, 2016, Plaintiffs mailed to EPA by certified mail, return receipt requested,  
14 written notice of intent to sue regarding the violations alleged in this Complaint. EPA received  
15 this notice of intent to sue letter no later than May 16, 2016. More than sixty days have passed  
16 since EPA received this “notice of intent to sue” letter. EPA has not remedied the violations  
17 alleged in this Complaint. Therefore, a present and actual controversy exists.

## 18 **IV. VENUE**

19 5. Defendant EPA resides in this judicial district. EPA Region 9, which has authority over  
20 California, is headquartered in San Francisco. This civil action is brought against an officer of  
21 the United States acting in her official capacity and a substantial part of the events or omissions  
22 giving rise to the claims in this case occurred in the Northern District of California. Therefore,  
23 venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e).

**V. INTRADISTRICT ASSIGNMENT**

6. A substantial part of the events and omissions giving rise to the claims in this case occurred in the County of San Francisco. EPA Region 9, which has authority over California, is headquartered in San Francisco. Accordingly, assignment to the San Francisco Division or the Oakland Division is proper pursuant to Civil L.R. 3-2(c) and (d).

**VI. PARTIES**

7. Plaintiff the CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY is a non-profit 501(c)(3) corporation incorporated in California. The Center for Biological Diversity has approximately 50,000 members throughout the United States and the world. The Center for Biological Diversity's mission is to ensure the preservation, protection, and restoration of biodiversity, native species, ecosystems, public lands and waters, and public health through science, policy, and environmental law. Based on the understanding that the health and vigor of human societies and the integrity and wildness of the natural environment are closely linked, the Center for Biological Diversity is working to secure a future for animals and plants hovering on the brink of extinction, for the ecosystems they need to survive, and for a healthy, livable future for all of us.

8. The Center for Biological Diversity and its members include individuals with varying interests in wildlife species and their habitat ranging from scientific, professional, and educational to recreational, aesthetic, moral, and spiritual. Further, the Center for Biological Diversity's members enjoy, on an ongoing basis, the biological, scientific, research, educational, conservation, recreational, and aesthetic values of the regions inhabited by these species, including the regions at issue in this action. The Center for Biological Diversity's members observe and study native species and their habitat, and derive professional, scientific, educational, recreational, aesthetic, inspirational, and other benefits from these activities and



1 have an interest in preserving the possibility of such activities in the future. The Center for  
2 Biological Diversity and its members have participated in efforts to protect and preserve natural  
3 areas, including the habitat essential to the continued survival of native species, and to address  
4 threats to the continued existence of these species, including the threats posed by air pollution  
5 and other contaminants.

6 9. Plaintiff the CENTER FOR ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH is an Oakland, California  
7 based nonprofit organization that helps protect the public from toxic chemicals and promotes  
8 business products and practices that are safe for public health and the environment. The Center  
9 for Environmental Health works in pursuit of a world in which all people live, work, learn, and  
10 play in healthy environments.

11 10. Plaintiff CLEAN AIR COUNCIL (“Council”) is a Philadelphia based nonprofit  
12 organization. It is a member-supported environmental organization serving the Mid-Atlantic  
13 Region. The Council is dedicated to protecting and defending everyone’s right to breathe clean  
14 air. The Council works through a broad array of related sustainability and public health  
15 initiatives, using public education, community action, government oversight, and enforcement of  
16 environmental laws.

17 11. Plaintiffs’ members live, work, recreate, travel and engage in other activities throughout  
18 the areas at issue in this complaint and will continue to do so on a regular basis. Pollution in the  
19 affected areas threatens and damages, and will continue to threaten and damage, the health and  
20 welfare of Plaintiffs’ members as well as their ability to engage in and enjoy their other  
21 activities. Pollution diminishes Plaintiff’s members’ ability to enjoy the aesthetic qualities and  
22 recreational opportunities of the affected area.

12. EPA's failure to timely perform the mandatory duties described herein also adversely affects Plaintiffs, as well as their members, by depriving them of procedural protection and opportunities, as well as information that they are entitled to under the Clean Air Act. The failure of EPA to perform the mandatory duties also creates uncertainty for Plaintiffs' members as to whether they are exposed to excess air pollution.

13. The above injuries will continue until the Court grants the relief requested herein.

14. Defendant GINA McCARTHY is the Administrator of the EPA. In that role Administrator McCarthy has been charged by Congress with the duty to administer the Clean Air Act, including the mandatory duties at issue in this case. Administrator McCarthy is also charged with overseeing all EPA regional offices including EPA Region 9, which has authority over California and is headquartered in San Francisco.

## VII. LEGAL BACKGROUND

15. Congress enacted the Clean Air Act to "speed up, expand, and intensify the war against air pollution in the United States with a view to assuring that the air we breathe throughout the Nation is wholesome once again." H.R. Rep. No. 1146, 91st Cong., 2d Sess. 1,1, 1970 U.S. Code Cong. & Admin. News 5356, 5356. To promote this, the Act requires EPA to set National Ambient Air Quality Standards for certain pollutants. 42 U.S.C. § 7409(a). National Ambient Air Quality Standards establish maximum allowable concentrations in the air of such pollutants.

16. After EPA promulgates a National Ambient Air Quality Standard, the Clean Air Act requires that EPA designate each area of the country as either a clean air area for that standard, which is known as "attainment" in Clean Air Act jargon, or a dirty air area, which is known as "nonattainment" in Clean Air Act jargon. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7407(d).

1 17. Under the Clean Air Act, each state is required to submit state implementation plans to  
2 ensure that each National Ambient Air Quality Standard will be achieved, maintained, and  
3 enforced. Without such plans, the public is not afforded full protection against the harmful  
4 impacts of air pollution.

5 18. For dirty air areas which EPA has designated as “nonattainment,” states must submit  
6 nonattainment area state implementation plans. *See* 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(a)(2)(I), 7501 – 7509a,  
7 7513 – 7513b.

8 19. The Clean Air Act requires EPA to determine whether any state implementation plan  
9 submittal is administratively complete. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B). EPA must make this  
10 determination by “no later than 6 months after the date, if any, by which a State is required to  
11 submit the plan or revision.” *Id.*

12 20. If a state fails to submit any required state implementation plan, there is no submittal that  
13 may be deemed administratively complete, and EPA must make a determination, and publish  
14 notice of that determination in the Federal Register, stating that the state failed to submit an  
15 administratively complete state implementation plan submittal within six months of when the  
16 submittal was due. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B). This is referred to as a “finding of failure to  
17 submit.”

18 21. Once a state does submit a state implementation plan submittal, EPA has a mandatory  
19 duty to take final action on any administratively complete state implementation plan submission  
20 by approving in full, disapproving in full, or approving in part and disapproving in part within 12  
21 months of the date the submission is deemed administratively complete. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(2)  
22 - (4).

## VIII. FACTS

22. This case involves EPA's failure to timely implement the National Ambient Air Quality Standards for ozone. While ozone is critical for the protection of the Earth when it is in the stratosphere, at ground level, ozone, the chief component of smog, is a dangerous air pollutant which causes a variety of adverse impacts.

23. According to EPA, based on exhaustive scientific review, ozone pollution causes decreased lung function, increased respiratory symptoms, emergency department visits, hospital admissions for respiratory causes, and even death. 73 Fed. Reg. 16,436 (Mar. 27, 2008).

24. Those most at risk from ozone pollution are children; active people, *e.g.*, runners and people who do manual labor outside; people with pre-existing lung and heart diseases such as asthma; and older people. *Id.* at 16,440. Ozone also damages vegetation, both native and commercial crops. *Id.* at 16,485-16,486. Damage to native vegetation results in ecosystem damage, including diminished ecosystem services, that is, the life sustaining services that ecosystems provide to people for free, such as clean air, clean water and carbon sequestration. *Id.*

25. In 2008, EPA strengthened the primary and secondary ozone NAAQS from 0.08 to 0.075 parts per million (ppm). 73 Fed.Reg. 16,436 (Mar. 27, 2008).

26. EPA made attainment and nonattainment designations for the 2008 ozone NAAQS effective July 20, 2012. *See* 77 Fed. Reg. 30,088 (May 21, 2012), 77 Fed. Reg. 34,221 (June 11, 2012).

27. EPA designated all of the areas listed in Tables 1 and 2 nonattainment or as part of the ozone transport region (OTR) for the 2008 ozone NAAQS. *Id.*

28. All elements of the nonattainment SIPs for the 2008 ozone NAAQS listed in Table 1 were due by no later than July 20, 2015. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. 12,264, 12,266 (Mar. 6, 2015).

29. Thus, EPA has a mandatory duty to make a completeness finding under 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B) for the SIP elements listed in Table 1 by no later than January 20, 2016.

## IX. CLAIM FOR RELIEF

### CLAIM ONE

(Failure to Make Findings of Failure to Submit.)

30. Plaintiffs incorporate by reference paragraphs 1 through 29.

31. The deadline for the 2008 ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standard nonattainment state implementation plan submissions listed in Table 1 is no later than July 20, 2015. *See* 80 Fed. Reg. 12,264, 12,266 (Mar. 6, 2015).

32. More than six months have passed since July 20, 2015.

33. For each of the areas and nonattainment SIP elements listed in Table 1 of paragraph 1 above, the relevant state has failed to submit the listed nonattainment SIP element.

34. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. 7410(k)(1)(B), EPA has a mandatory duty to make a finding of failure to submit by no later than January 20, 2016 for each area's nonattainment SIP elements listed in Table 1 of paragraph 1 above.

35. EPA has failed to make such findings.

### CLAIM TWO

(Failure to Take Final Action on State Implementation Plan Submissions.)

36. Plaintiffs incorporate by reference paragraphs 1 through 35.

37. The Clean Air Act requires EPA to determine whether any state implementation plan submission is administratively complete. 42 U.S.C. 7410(k)(1)(B).

1 38. If, six months after a state submits a state implementation plan, EPA has not made the  
2 completeness finding and has not found the submission to be incomplete, the submission is  
3 deemed administratively complete by operation of law. *Id.*

4 39. EPA must take final action on an administratively complete submission by approving in  
5 full, disapproving in full, or approving in part and disapproving in part within 12 months of the  
6 date of the submission's administrative completeness finding. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(2) - (4).

7 40. Each area's nonattainment SIP elements listed in Table 2 of paragraph 1 above was  
8 deemed administratively complete, either by EPA or by operation of law, by the date listed in  
9 Table 2 of paragraph 1.

10 41. EPA has a mandatory duty to take final action, and publish notice of that action in the  
11 Federal Register, by approving in full, disapproving in full, or approving in part and  
12 disapproving in part each area's nonattainment SIP elements listed in Table 2 of paragraph 1  
13 above by no later than one year after the nonattainment SIP element was deemed  
14 administratively complete. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(2) and (4).

15 42. However, EPA has failed to approve in full, disapprove in full, or approve in part and  
16 disapprove in part each area's nonattainment SIP elements listed in Table 2 of paragraph 1 above  
17 by no later than one year after the nonattainment SIP element was deemed administratively  
18 complete.

#### 19 **REQUEST FOR RELIEF**

20 WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court:

21 A. Declare that the Administrator is in violation of the Clean Air Act with regard to her  
22 failure to perform the mandatory duties listed above;  
23

- 1 B. Issue a mandatory injunction requiring the Administrator to perform her mandatory  
2 duties listed above by certain dates;
- 3 C. Retain jurisdiction of this matter for purposes of enforcing the Court's order;
- 4 D. Grant Plaintiffs their reasonable costs of litigation, including attorneys' and experts' fees;  
5 and;
- 6 E. Grant such further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

7  
8 Respectfully submitted,

9 /s/Jonathan Evans

Jonathan Evans (Cal. Bar #247376)

CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY

1212 Broadway

Suite 800

Oakland, CA 94612

Phone: 510-844-7100 x318

Fax: 510-844-7150

email: [jevans@biologicaldiversity.org](mailto:jevans@biologicaldiversity.org)

Counsel for Plaintiffs

14 Dated: July 21, 2016